

An Inquiry into the Characteristics of Dissimulative Narrations in Qur'anic Exegesis

Date Received: June 25, 2022

Date Accepted: December 2, 2023

Marzieh Esrafil¹

Hamidreza Rahimi²

Abstract

Taqiyyah (dissimulation) is a concept posited as a factor influencing Hadith issuance. Identifying Narrations issued under dissimulation necessitates meticulous examination, as the infallible Imam (P.B.U.H.) does not express the actual ruling or his sound opinion in this situation. The presence of such Narrations within *tafsir* (Qur'anic exegesis) remains a topic of debate. Those who endorse the existence of dissimulation in Qur'anic exegesis have ascribed specific characteristics to this category of Narrations. This study, utilizing a descriptive-analytical approach and consulting Hadith sources, aims to explore the alleged characteristics associated with dissimulative Narrations in Qur'anic exegesis and to determine the validity of the claim regarding the dissimulative nature of this type of Narration. This analysis discusses four characteristics of dissimulative Narrations in exegesis: Contradiction with the Shi'i theological and doctrinal principles; Alignment with the beliefs of Sunnis; Widespread acceptance among the Sunnis, and Incompatibility with the context of the Qur'anic verses. Evaluation of this category of Narration reveals four reasons for the weakness of the dissimulative nature of such Narrations: Absence of key elements typically associated with the issuance of Hadith under dissimulation; Clear indications of forgery; Infiltration of *Israiliyyat* (inauthentic Judaic Narrations) into this group of Narrations, and Contradiction of some of these Narrations with Qur'anic verses.

¹ Ph.D. in Islamic Knowledge Teacher Training, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran (Corresponding author)

(m.esrafil.40@gmail.com).

² M.A. in Interpretation and Quranic Sciences, University of Al-Mustafa, Qom, Iran (hr.rahimi1992@gmail.com)

Keywords: Dissimulation, Taqiyyah Narrations, Exegetical Narrations,
Israiliyyat, Causes of Hadith Issuance

Analysis of the so-called Hadith "al-ṣalātu mi'rāj al-mu'min" (prayer is the believer's ascension) in Early and Late Sources of Sunni and Shi'a Islam and Its Validation Through Parallel Narrations

Date Received: February 25, 2023

Date Accepted: December 2, 2023

Seyyed Morteza Hosseini Shirag¹

Mohammad Reza Akmal²

Abstract

Numerous Narrations emphasizing the significance and virtues of prayer have been documented within the early and late sources of both Islamic schools of thought, alongside Qur'anic verses. One frequently cited expression concerning prayer is the saying "*al-ṣalātu mi'rāj al-mu'min*" (prayer is the believer's ascension), ascribed to Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H.) in some texts. This study, utilizing the content analysis method and based upon library resources, aims to investigate the origin and validity of this so-called Hadith. A review of early Shi'a and Sunni texts reveals no evidence of a saying as widely recognized and disseminated as this one. Moreover, its inclusion in later works lacks a *sanad* (chain of transmission) or established source, relying solely on attribution to the Prophet (P.B.U.H.). However, by analyzing parallel Narrations, the concept of prayer serving as a *qurbān* (a means of drawing closer to God) is clearly established. The Hadith "*al-ṣalātu qurbānu kulli taqī*" (prayer serves as a means for every pious person to draw him closer to God), possessing an uninterrupted chain of transmission in both Sunni and Shi'a sources, stands as the sole Narration within these parallel accounts that can be considered reliable. The concept of prayer as *mi'rāj* (ascension) cannot be substantiated through established Hadiths and appears to be a maxim originating from later scholars. Notably, the role of paraphrasing has

¹ Ph.D. in Quranic and Hadith Sciences, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; Instructor at Farhangiyān University of Southern Khorasan Province; (Corresponding author) (morteza.hosseini@yahoo.com).

² M.A. in Quranic and Hadith Sciences (akmalimm1355@gmail.com).

demonstrably played a significant role in the formation of the maxim "*al-ṣalātu mi'rāj al-mu'min*" and similar expressions.

Keywords: Prayer, Ascension, Believer, Paraphrasing

Biographical (rijālī) and Catalogic (fihristī) Analysis of the Hadith Scholar Munakhkhal ibn Jamil and Discussions on His Exegesis (tafsīr)

Date Received: August 21, 2023

Date Accepted: December 2, 2023

Seyyed Reza Shirazi¹

Seyyed Hossein Shafiei Darabi²

Aghileh Sadat Ghomashi³

Abstract

Munakhkhal ibn Jamāl al-Asadī has received relatively scant independent scholarly attention within the field of Hadith Sciences. A recent methodological development in Hadith evaluation is "catalogic (*fihristī*) analysis," which offers a comprehensive toolkit for gathering information regarding Hadith narrators and their path of transmission. One stage of this method involves the "biographical and catalogic investigation" of Hadith narrators. In this stage, through simultaneously evaluating the *sanad* (chain of transmitters) and the text, and considering the context of Hadith issuance, and factors such as the cultural situation; the identification of teachers (*shaykhs*) and narrators; the content of Narrations, and intellectual and theological inclinations of narrators, an effort is made to identify the narrators and the transmitters (*ṭarīq*) of a book. Some of the research findings are as follows: 1. *Munakhkhal* lacks direct Narration from an infallible Imam (P.B.U.H.). 2. The general thematic content of his Narrations bears a resemblance to the beliefs of the *Ghulat* (extremist Shi'a sects), leading to accusations of *ghuluww* (extremism) against him. 3. His Quranic exegesis (*tafsīr*) is not an independent work, but rather an edited or summarized version of the exegesis of *Jabir ibn Yazīd al-Ju'fī*.

¹ Assistant Professor, Razavi Research Center of Islamic Sciences, Mashhad, Iran (Corresponding Author) (srshirazi@islamic-rf.ir).

² Assistant Professor, Department of Interpretation and Quranic Sciences, University of Al-Mustafa, Qom, Iran (shafieidarabi@chmail.ir).

³ Level 3 Student in Interpretation and Quranic Sciences, Al-Zahra University, Qom, Iran (agh1363310@gmail.com).

Keywords: Catalogic Analysis, Narrative Quranic Exegesis, Shia Extremists, Shia Extremism

An Analysis of the Razawi Hadith "shī`atunā al-musallimūn li amrinā" (Our Shia are those who submit to our command) on the Characteristics of the Shia: A Sanad (chain of transmission) and Thematic Perspective

Date Received: December 14, 2022

Date Accepted: December 2, 2023

Seyyed Mahmoud Marvian Hoseini¹

Seyyed Ali Delbari²

Hosein Amini³

Abstract

Examining the Narrations of the Infallible Imams (P.B.U.T.) concerning the attributes of a true Shi'a reveals a comprehensive framework of characteristics that serve as criteria for identifying an individual as Shi'a. One such Narration, found in the book of *ṣifāt al-shi'a*, ascribed to Imam Riḍa (P.B.U.H.), states: "Our Shia are those who submit to our command, adhere to our words, and oppose our enemies. Whoever is not like this is not of us." This article adopts a descriptive-analytical approach to examine the authenticity and content of this Hadith. The article's findings indicate that the chain of transmission (*sanad*) associated with this Hadith is deemed reliable based on the *General Authentication (tauthiqat al-'ammah) Rules*. Furthermore, due to the well-attested nature of the Hadith's meaning (*tawatur al-ma'nawi*), a detailed evaluation of the chain of transmission is not considered necessary. The qualification of an individual as a genuine Shia rests upon the embodiment of a tripartite conceptual framework: first, the adherence to the doctrine of Imams' guardianship (*wilayah*); second, the strict and unconditional compliance with the teachings of the Infallible Imams (P.B.U.T.); and finally, the active opposition, both in words and actions, against those who harbor enmity

¹ Assistant Professor, Department of Quranic and Hadith Sciences, Razavi University of Islamic Sciences, Mashhad, Iran (marvian@razavi.ac.ir).

² Associate Professor, Department of Quranic and Hadith Sciences, Razavi University of Islamic Sciences, Mashhad, Iran (delbari@razavi.ac.ir).

³ Level 3 Student, Khorasan Seminary; M.A. Student in Quranic and Hadith Sciences, Razavi University of Islamic Sciences, Mashhad, Iran (Corresponding Author) (hossein.amini011@gmail.com).

towards the Imams (P.B.U.T.). In essence, a true Shia exemplifies the principles of *tawalli* (friendship and allegiance to the Ahlul Bayt (P.B.U.T.)) and *tabarri* (dissociation from their adversaries).

Keywords: Imam Reza, Characteristics of a Shia, Unconditional Obedience, Sanad (Chain of Transmission) Analysis, Hadith Jurisprudence

Assessment of the Authenticity of Abū Jamīlah Mufaḍḍal ibn Ṣāliḥ

Date Received: January 18, 2022

Date Accepted: December 2, 2023

Salih Montazeri¹

Abstract

Abū Jamīlah Mufaḍḍal ibn Ṣāliḥ emerges as a prominent figure within Shi'ite Hadith scholarship. His Narrations have been extensively documented throughout various Hadith collections. Recognized for his prolific contributions, biographical sources also mention him as a companion of Imam Ṣadiq and Imam Kaẓim (P.B.U.T.). The question of his authenticity and his susceptibility to weakness remains a subject of debate. His inauthenticity has gained widespread acceptance among scholars. This owes much to the trenchant critiques offered by *al-Najashi*, *Ibn al-Ghaḍa'iri*, *'Allamah al-Ḥilli*, and *Ibn Dāwūd al-Ḥilli*. In contrast, some scholars maintain his authenticity. This study adopts a descriptive-analytical methodology to present the current perspectives on this matter. The author undertook a critical evaluation of the arguments by examining various perspectives and viewpoints put forth by proponents of each opinion. According to the author, the arguments presented by individuals who undermine Mufaddal ibn Ṣāliḥ are lacking in completeness. According to certain General Authentication (*tauthiqat al-'ammah*) Rules, such as extensive transmission by prominent scholars and the transmission through the three reliable shaykhs (namely *Ibn Abi 'Umayr*, *al-Ṣafwan*, and *al-Bazanti*), who exclusively narrate from trustworthy sources, the authenticity of Abū Jamīlah is confirmed. Therefore, in the author's opinion, Mufaḍḍal ibn Ṣāliḥ is a trustworthy and Imami narrator.

Keywords: Abū Jamīlah, Mufaḍḍal ibn Ṣāliḥ, Authentication

¹ Assistant Professor, Department of Islamic Law, University of Judicial Sciences and Administrative Services (corresponding author) (salehmontazeri@ujscas.ac.ir).

Source Recovery and Evaluation of Amr ibn Jumay's Narrations in al-Kāfi

Date Received: March 14, 2023

Date Accepted: December 2, 2023

Seyyed Soleyman Mousavi¹

Seyyede Jamileh Hashemnia²

Seyyed Ali Delbari³

Abstract

Amr ibn Jumay' is one of the narrators whose reliability has been heavily contested by scholars of Hadith. Despite this, *al-Kāfi* by *al-Kulayni* incorporates approximately twenty Narrations attributed to the Imams (P.B.U.T.) with *Amr ibn Jumay'* as the immediate transmitter. This descriptive-analytical study investigates the inclusion of these Narrations within *al-Kāfi* and seeks to identify the sources from which *al-Kulayni* derived these Hadiths. Given the prevalence of written transmission methods within Shi'a Islam, this research employs the Source Recovery method that consults the paths (*ṭarīqs*) of *al-Najāshi* and *al-Ṭūsi* to works of the Companions of the Imams (P.B.U.T.). Additionally, the study examines the textual content of the Narrations attributed to *Amr ibn Jumay'* within *al-Kāfi*. The analysis revealed that these Narrations are derived from approximately seven different sources. Furthermore, the subject matter of the majority of these Narrations pertains to doctrinal and ethical matters. Notably, *al-Kulayni* just narrated a limited number of Hadiths from him on jurisprudential matters and rulings. This observation may suggest a degree of agreement between *al-Kulayni* and the scholars of Hadith regarding the unreliability of *Amr ibn Jumay'*.

Keywords: *al-Kāfi* by *al-Kulayni*, *Amr ibn Jumay'*, Immediate Narrators, Path of Hadith, Written Transmission of Hadith.

¹ Ph.D. Student in Quranic and Hadith Sciences, Razavi University of Islamic Sciences, Mashhad, Iran

² Ph.D. Student in Quranic and Hadith Sciences, Razavi University of Islamic Sciences, Mashhad, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Quranic and Hadith Sciences, Razavi University of Islamic Sciences, Mashhad, Iran